

E-Learning Maturity Model Processes

(Marshall and Mitchell, 2004)

Learning: Processes that directly impact on pedagogical aspects of e-learning	
L1.	Courses are designed to require students to engage themselves in analysis, synthesis, and evaluation as part of their course and programme requirements
L2.	Student interaction with teaching staff and other students is an essential characteristic and is facilitated through a variety of ways
L3.	Teaching staff clearly communicate how communication channels should be used during a course or programme
L4.	Teaching staff manage student expectations over the type and timeliness of responses to student communications
L5.	Feedback to student assignments and questions is constructive and provided in a timely manner
L6.	Students are instructed in the proper methods of effective research, including assessment of the validity of resources
L7.	Learning outcomes for each course are summarized in a clearly written, straightforward statement
L8.	Assessment of students communicates high expectations
L9.	Student work is subject to clearly communicated timetables and deadlines
L10.	Courses are designed to support a diversity of learning styles and to ensure accessibility
Development: Processes surrounding the creation and maintenance of e-learning resources	
D1.	Guidelines regarding minimum standards are used for course development, design and delivery
D2.	The reliability of the technology delivery system is as failsafe as possible
D3.	Learning outcomes, not the availability of existing technology, determine the technology being used to deliver content
D4.	Technical assistance in course development is available to teaching staff
D5.	Teaching staff are encouraged to use technical assistance when (re)developing courses
D6.	Teaching staff members are assisted in the transition from classroom teaching to online instruction
Coordination & Support: Processes around the day-to-day management and support of e-learning delivery	
C1.	A centralized system provides support for building and maintaining the e-learning infrastructure
C2.	Students have access to sufficient library resources that may include a "virtual library" accessible through the WWW
C3.	Teaching staff and students agree upon expectations regarding times for student assignment completion and staff response
C4.	Students are provided with hands-on training and information to aid them in securing material from a range of sources consistent with the discipline or subject.
C5.	Students have convenient access to technical assistance throughout the duration of the course/programme
C6.	Students are provided with detailed instructions regarding the electronic media used in a course prior to commencing it
C7.	Students are able to practice with any technologies prior to commencing a course
C8.	Questions directed to student service personnel are answered accurately and quickly
C9.	A structured system is in place to address student complaints
C10.	Instructor training and assistance continues through the progression of the online course
C11.	Academics are provided support resources to deal with issues arising from student use of electronically-accessed data
Evaluation: Processes surrounding the evaluation and quality control of e-learning through its entire lifecycle.	
E1.	The programme's educational effectiveness is formatively and summatively assessed with multiple, standards based, and independent evaluations
E2.	The programme's teaching/learning process is formatively and summatively assessed with multiple, standards based, and independent evaluations
E3.	Summative data such as enrolment numbers, completion rates, and costing is used as a measure of effectiveness within course/programmes
E4.	Success of technology/innovation used as a measure of effectiveness within course/programmes
E5.	Intended learning outcomes are reviewed regularly to ensure clarity, utility, and appropriateness
E6.	Instructional materials are reviewed periodically to ensure they meet programme standards
E7.	Teaching staff capability in making the transition from classroom to online teaching is formally assessed during training
Organisation: Processes associated with institutional planning and management	
O1.	A documented set of formal criteria are used to determine access to funding and other resources which support course and programme (re)development
O2.	A documented technology plan is in place and operational to ensure quality of delivery standards
O3.	A documented technology plan is in place and operational to ensure the integrity and validity of information delivered, collected and stored
O4.	Before starting a programme, students are advised of any particular requirements of that programme to ensure they possess the personal and technical skills needed for that programme
O5.	Students are provided with supplemental course information that outlines course objectives, concepts and ideas
O6.	Students are provided with supplemental course information that outlines admission requirements, tuition and fees and other relevant administration information
O7.	Students are provided with supplemental course information that outlines requirements for additional resources such as books or other materials
O8.	Students are provided with supplemental course information that outlines student support services.
O9.	Before starting a programme, students are advised of any particular technological requirements of that programme to ensure they have access to the minimal technology required by the course design

E-Learning Maturity Model v1.0

Process category	Brief description
Learning	Processes that directly impact on pedagogical aspects of e-Learning
Development	Processes surrounding the creation and maintenance of e-Learning resources
Co-ordination	Processes surrounding the oversight and management of e-Learning
Evaluation	Processes surrounding the evaluation and quality control of e-Learning through its entire lifecycle.
Organisation	Processes associated with institutional planning and management

eMM process categories (Marshall and Mitchell, 2003)

e-Learning Maturity Model: Levels	
Level	Focus
5: Optimised	Continual improvement in all aspects of the e-Learning process
4: Managed	Ensuring the quality of both the e-learning resources and student learning outcomes
3: Defined	Defined process for development and support of e-Learning
2: Planned	Clear and measurable objectives for e-learning projects
1: Initial	Ad-hoc processes
0: Not performed	Not done at all

eMM capability levels (Marshall and Mitchell, 2003)

Bibliography

- Marshall, S. & Mitchell, G., (2002). Potential Indicators of e-Learning Process Capability. in Proceedings of EDUCAUSE in Australasia 2003 (Adelaide, EDUCAUSE, 2003)
- Marshall, S., & Mitchell, G., (2003). An E-Learning Maturity Model? in A. Williamson, K. Gunn, A. Young, and T. Clear (eds), Proceedings of the 19th Annual Conference of the Australian Society for Computers in Learning in Tertiary Education (Auckland, Australian Society for Computers in Learning in Tertiary Education, 2002) <http://docushare.unitec.ac.nz/dscgi/ds.py/Get/File-231/173.pdf> Accessed 19 Nov 2004
- Marshall, S.J. & Mitchell, G. (2004). Applying SPICE to e-Learning: An E-Learning Maturity Model? in Proceedings of the Sixth Australasian Computing Education Conference (ACE2004), Dunedin. Conferences in Research and Practice in Information Technology, Vol. 30. R. Lister and A. Young, Eds.
- Marshall, S. (2005). Determination of New Zealand Tertiary Institution E-Learning Capability: An Application of an E-Learning Maturity Model: Report on the E-Learning Maturity Model Evaluation of the New Zealand Tertiary Sector. Report to the New Zealand Ministry of Education. 132pp
- Marshall, S.J. and Mitchell, G. (2005). E-Learning Process Maturity in the New Zealand Tertiary Sector. In Proceedings of EDUCAUSE in Australasia 2005, Auckland, NZ.

more information and copies of reports is available on the project web site at

<http://www.utdc.vuw.ac.nz/research/emm/>

	University A	University B	University C	University D	University E	University F	Polytechnic Z	Polytechnic Y	Polytechnic X
Learning: Processes that directly impact on pedagogical aspects of e-learning									
L1. Courses are designed to require students to engage themselves in analysis, synthesis, and evaluation as part of their course and program requirements									
L2. Student interaction with faculty and other students is an essential characteristic and is facilitated through a variety of ways									
L3. Teaching staff clearly communicate how communication channels should be used during a course or programme									
L4. Teaching staff manage student expectations over the type and timeliness of responses to student communications									
L5. Feedback to student assignments and questions is constructive and provided in a timely manner									
L6. Students are instructed in the proper methods of effective research, including assessment of the validity of resources									
L7. Learning outcomes for each course are summarized in a clearly written, straightforward statement									
L8. Assessment of students communicates high expectations									
L9. Student work is subject to clearly communicated timetables and deadlines									
L10. Courses are designed to support a diversity of learning styles and to ensure accessibility									
Development: Processes surrounding the creation and maintenance of e-learning resources									
D1. Guidelines regarding minimum standards are used for course development, design and delivery									
D2. The reliability of the technology delivery system is as failsafe as possible									
D3. Learning outcomes, not the availability of existing technology, determine the technology being used to deliver course content									
D4. Technical assistance in course development is available to teaching staff									
D5. Teaching staff are encouraged to use technical assistance when (re)developing courses									
D6. Teaching staff are assisted in the transition from classroom teaching to online instruction									
Coordination & Support: Processes around the day-to-day management and support of e-learning delivery									
C1. A centralized system provides support for building and maintaining the e-learning infrastructure									
C2. Students have access to sufficient library resources that may include a "virtual library" accessible through the World Wide Web									
C3. Teaching staff and students agree upon expectations regarding times for student assignment completion and staff response									
C4. Students are provided with hands-on training and information to aid them in securing material from a range of sources consistent with the discipline or subject									
C5. Students have convenient access to technical assistance throughout the duration of the course/program									
C6. Students are provided with detailed instructions regarding the electronic media used in a course prior to commencing it									
C7. Students are able to practice with any technologies prior to commencing a course									
C8. Questions directed to student service personnel are answered accurately and quickly									
C9. A structured system is in place to address student complaints									
C10. Teaching staff training and assistance continues through the progression of the online course									
C11. Teaching staff are provided with support resources to deal with issues arising from student use of electronically-accessed data									
Evaluation: Processes surrounding the evaluation and quality control of e-learning through its entire lifecycle									
E1. The programme's educational effectiveness is formatively and summatively assessed with multiple, standards based, and independent evaluations									
E2. The programme's teaching/learning process is formatively and summatively assessed with multiple, standards based, and independent evaluations									
E3. Summative data such as enrolment numbers, completion rates, and costing is used as a measure of effectiveness within course/programmes									
E4. Success of technology/innovation used as a measure of effectiveness within course/programmes									
E5. Intended learning outcomes are reviewed regularly to ensure clarity, utility, and appropriateness									
E6. Instructional materials are reviewed periodically to ensure they meet programme standards									
E7. Teaching staff capability in making the transition from classroom to online teaching is formally assessed during training									
Organisation: Processes associated with institutional planning and management									
O1. A documented set of formal criteria are used to determine access to funding and other resources which support course and programme (re)development									
O2. A documented technology plan is in place and operational to ensure quality of delivery standards									
O3. A documented technology plan is in place and operational to ensure the integrity and validity of information delivered, collected and stored									
O4. Before starting a programme, students are advised of any particular requirements of that programme to ensure they possess the personal and technical skills needed for that programme									
O5. Students are provided with supplemental course information that outlines course objectives, concepts and ideas									
O6. Students are provided with supplemental course information that outlines admission requirements, tuition and fees and other relevant administration information									
O7. Students are provided with supplemental course information that outlines requirements for additional resources such as books or other materials									
O8. Students are provided with supplemental course information that outlines student support services									
O9. Before starting a programme, students are advised of any particular technological requirements of that programme to ensure they have access to the minimal technology required by the course design									

	Not practised/not adequate
	Partially adequate
	Largely adequate
	Fully adequate
	Not assessed

New Zealand Tertiary Sector E-Learning Capability
31st March 2005
(Marshall, 2005)